

# **EVALUATION REPORT**

**State Training and Resource Centre Chhattisgarh**

**Submitted by**

**Roshni Subhash and Pankaj Sarma**

**March 2010**

# **Content**

## **List of Abbreviations**

## **Executive summary**

### **1. Background**

#### 1.1 State Training and Resource Centre Evaluation

##### 1.1.1 Purpose

##### 1.1.2 Objectives

#### 1.2 Evaluation Methodology

### **2. Three Day Evaluation Schedule**

### **3. Key Findings**

#### 3.1 STRC Fact Sheet

#### **3.2 Programme Delivery**

##### 3.2.1 Identification and Capacity Building of Faculty

##### 3.2.2 Trainings by STRC

##### 3.2.3 Academic Committee and Programme Planning

##### 3.2.4 Documentation and Reporting

##### 3.2.5 Conclusions

#### **3.3 Organizational Capacity**

##### 3.3.1 Recruitment and induction

##### 3.3.2 Record keeping and Procedures

##### 3.3.3 Staff meetings

##### 3.3.4 Governance and Leadership

##### 3.3.5 Conclusions

#### **3.4 Finance**

##### 3.4.1 Contract & its validity

##### 3.4.2 Operation of Bank Account and Availability of Fund

##### 3.4.3 Utilization of Fund

##### 3.4.4 Maintenance of Financial Records

##### 3.4.5 Submission of SOE

#### **4. Annexure**

Annexure 1- Discussions Group Discussions with trained NGO staff

Annexure 2 – Discussions with DD-TI CGSACS

Annexure 3- Discussions with Faculty

Annexure 4- Interaction with MSM- TI Samta Mahila Manch

## List of Abbreviations

CGSACS	Chhattisgarh State Aids Control Society
DD-TI	Deputy Director - Targeted Interventions
FSW	Female Sex Workers
IDUs	Injecting Drug Users
IEC	Information- Education -Communication
MSM	Men having Sex with Men
ORW	Out Reach Worker
PD	project Director
PE	Peer Educator
PM	Programme Manager
SOE	Statement of Expenditure
TI	Targeted Intervention
TNA	Training Needs assessment
TSU	Technical Support Unit
VPL	Voluntary Peer Leader

## **Executive Summary**

This evaluation report contains observations and evaluator's comments on process, quality and quantity with regard to the performance of the STRC on various indicators put down by NACO. The two components examined here are Programme Delivery and Organizational Capacity. Presented in this section are the achievements, challenges and areas for development for the STRC

Samarthan Centre for Development Support hosts the STRC for Chhattisgarh within its Raipur office. Samarthan has been working in Chhattisgarh for over 15 years on various concerns like education and governance. It has played the role of a capacity building partner for various NGOs? Grounded in beliefs of decentralization, local governance and participation Samarthan's capacity building efforts have also gained currency for being contextual and participatory.

Samarthan has deputed its experienced team members towards the STRC activities in order to ensure quality trainings. The achievements of STRC in the past year could be enumerated as follows

1. The STRC team despite not having an experience of TIs has been able to develop a critical understanding of the functioning and capacity building needs of TIs. This was achieved through study of Operational Guidelines, multiple field visits and interactions with SACS and TSU.
2. In the process of developing its own understanding, the STRC has taken into cognizance the fact that all TIs from contracted in 2009 were new to this implementation. The STRC has developed references for them by translating and simplifying sections of the operational guidelines as well as many such documents in Hindi.
3. The STRC has also understood the need for building a local resource pool and has worked towards identification and training of the members. They have also been able to use this local resource in decentralizing their PE and VPL induction trainings as well as the PPP roll out.
4. Despite challenging circumstances a number of trainings have been conducted by the STRC for various cadres of the TIs.
5. The STRC has played the role of a support to CGSACs. It has been able to translate as well as develop various modules and IEC material for wider dissemination through CGSACS.

6. Organizationally Samarthan has been able to depute its personnel and resources in support of the STRC. In the event of delayed funds disbursement Samarthan has been able to retain its staff as well as build their capacity and conduct STRC activities.

The challenges faced by the STRC have been

1. The primary challenge for the STRC has been the delay in the disbursement of the first installment. This has at various instances hampered speedy progress on their part as well as diluted their standing initially with stakeholders.
2. Chhattisgarh did not have to its advantage expertise at the state level (beyond SACS and TSU). Garnering resources from other states as well as building capacities of institutions and Individuals with no Prior TI experience has proven to be a challenge.
3. High attrition in the TIs has lead to mixed levels of understanding in the participants' pool. Repeated inductions are required and are not always easy to schedule.
4. Limited personnel available with the STRC as recruitment was put on hold owing to uncertainty regarding the fund flow

The areas on which the STRC would need to focus on to achieve optimal results.

1. Focused development and training plan for the local resource pool.
2. The quality of pre and post assessments preparation needs to be examined. Both the content and methods of analysis needs to be reviewed in order to present a clearer picture of participants learning.
3. The field support provided by the STRC needs to be documented in greater detail.
4. A strategy for learning site development needs to be framed in consultation with the SACS and TSU.

## **Background**

### **1.1 State Training and Resource Centre Evaluation**

National AIDS Control Programme Phase III (NACP III) is focused on saturating the coverage of core and bridge population through targeted intervention programmes. To standardize systems and procedures, operational guidelines have been developed for all categories of TIS proposals namely, Men having Sex with Men (MSM), Female Sex Workers (FSW), Injecting Drug Users (IDU), Migrants and Truckers.

In order to ensure standardised and quality trainings to different categories of staff working with NGOs/CBOs on TI's with a mandate to develop a sustainable and institutionalised centre for the capacity building of partner organizations for TI's, gather learning through additional research and develop pedagogy of learning for TI scale up, National AIDS Control Organization has decided to institutionalize the training and capacity building process with the State Training and Resource Centres (STRC).

**1.1.1 Purpose:** The following exercise is being undertaken to evaluate the performance and quality of State Training and Resource Centre, Chhattisgarh

**1.1.2 Objectives:** To conduct a year end evaluation of STRC Chhattisgarh

### **1.2 Evaluation Methodology**

Evaluation consultant Ms Roshni Subhash spent three days with the STRC and undertook a review of the work done on various deliverables and indicators. To achieve this, documents and reports were reviewed, discussions and interviews with staff and faculty and NGOs trained by the STRC were also held. The consultant also interacted with CGSACS and undertook a field visit to a TI in order to seek their comments and feedback on the activities of the STRC.

Mr Pankaj Sarma, NERO and Mr Manish Mathur PHFI undertook the financial evaluation components. To this end they held discussions with the STRC team, reviewed the various record keeping and reporting mechanisms, especially those pertaining to Financial systems.

## 2. Three Day Evaluation Schedule

### Evaluation Schedule - Ms. Roshni Subhash

Date	Activity
7 <sup>th</sup> March 2010	Introductory meeting with STRC
	Discussions with STRC team on Programme Delivery
8 <sup>th</sup> March 2010	Discussions with STRC Team on Organizational Capacity
9 <sup>th</sup> March 2010	Discussions with Training participants.
	Discussions with CGSACS
	Field Visit – Samta Mahila Manch , MSM -TI

### Evaluation Schedule - Mr. Pankaj Sarma and Mr. Manish Mathur

Date	Activity
18 <sup>th</sup> March 2010	Discussions with STRC team and record verification
19 <sup>th</sup> March 2010	Verification of records and meeting with SACS

:



## Key Findings

### 3.1 STRC Fact Sheet

#### 1. Basic Details

**Table B – Basic Details**

A.	Name of the STRC	Samarthan STRC Chhattisgarh
B.	Name of the Implementing Partner	Samarthan Centre for Development
C.	States/ UTs Covered	Chhattisgarh
D.	Number of Districts covered	11
E.	Date of Contract with NACO	15 <sup>th</sup> November 09
F.	Date on which started functioning	1 <sup>st</sup> Dec 09
G.	Number of TI partners covered	23 at the time of signing the contract and 14 currently
H.	Location of STRC:	Samarthan Centre for Development, Raipur

#### 2. STRC Current Team

Position	Number
Training Coordinator	1
Training Officers	1

#### 2. Details of the Academic Committees formed by STRC

Sno	Name of Committee Members	Representation	Joining Date
1.	Dr. Indira Mishra	Ex. Principal Secretary	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
2.	Mr. Vikrant Verma	SACS Representative, D.D. TI-CGSACS	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09

3.	Dr. Kamlesh Jain	Representative from SHRC	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
4.	Mrs. Anupama Tiwari	DPM-RCH	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
5.	Prof. Shantha Kumar	(HNLU) Professor	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
6.	Prof. R.V. Bhawe	(Sociology) Professor	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
7.	Dr. Satyabhama Awasthi	NGO Representative	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
8.	Mrs. Manisha Sharma	PD (FSW)	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
9.	Mr. Anshuman Jha	Correspondent Zee-24 Hour News	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
10.	Dr. Sharad	Team Leader -MSU –CARE	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
11.	Mr. Vikas Singh Rajput	Community Representative-MSM	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09
12.	Dr. Manish Shrivastava	Training Coordinator – STRC	4 <sup>th</sup> Jun 09

## **3.2 PROGRAMME DELIVERY**

### **3.2.1 Identification and Capacity Building of Faculty**

#### 3.2.1.1 Identification of Faculty Members <sup>1</sup>

The Faculty list as stated in the STRC annual report<sup>2</sup>

<b>S.no</b>	<b>Category</b>	<b>Number</b>
1	NGO's working with FSW	293
2	NGO's Working with Migrants	215
3	NGOs working with MSM	292
4	Trainers at the National Level	20
5	Trainers at the State Level	09
6	Trainers at the state level on Finance	05
7	Mentors at the state level (CGSACS identified)	10
8	Local resources	21
9	STRCs across the country	14

As the STRC is relatively new to TIs and the TIs also were contracted at the same time as the STRC, it was difficult for the STRC to immediately identify a faculty pool. In consultation with SACS, TSU and the STRCs of neighboring states as well as research on the internet the organizations and individuals in the above list have been identified. DD-TI-CGSACS also shared that currently most trainers and faculty were being invited from outside the state as there were almost no resources within the state and there was a need to develop local capacities.

---

<sup>11</sup> The list below is a raw list of individuals and organizations based on the preliminary explorations made by the STRC. The final consolidated number would be much lesser. A speculative discussion with the STRC on the resources that could be trained in the state brought out a number not beyond 50.

The Directory does not provide the areas of expertise for different individuals. However, the evaluator has reviewed profiles of resource persons in use as well as various trainings imparted to local resources to develop an understanding of the same.

In the upcoming year STRC needs to put in effort into organizing their resource directory. However in the coming year they would need to build a directory of trained and accessible resources and outline their areas of specific expertise.

### **3.2.1.2 Training of Faculty Members**

The STRC and DD SACs shared concerns in the state in relation to previously operating TIs and a crisis which led to the contracting of new TIs. In the given context identifying local expertise was challenging. Hence, a strategy was used and wherein persons with extensive training experience on health and related issues were identified and they were further oriented on TI specific themes.

The table lists such capacity building efforts made by the STRC at the state level.

<b>Sino</b>	<b>Topic / Module</b>	<b>Nos</b>
1	TOT on STI Management and P PP	19 part of TOT and 10 used further to roll out trainings
2	TOT on for induction of PEs and VPL	35 part of TOT and 21 used to further roll out the Trainings

The STRC further plans to provide orientation and capacity building opportunities for its faculty, by involving them as participants in some TOTs as well as regular theme based trainings for the TI cadres. However they are currently negotiating with CGSACS to permit the latter.

### **3.2.1.3 Capacity of Faculty Members**

#### **Interviews**

Telephonic interviews were conducted with two members of the STRC faculty. The interactions revealed that the faculty from Gujarat had a longstanding experience with HIV related

programmes and was also trained on various concerns related to the TIs. The Local resource person was relatively new to TIs and was heading a TI since 2009. He was trained on the induction of PEs and VPL and was given support by the STRC to augment his knowledge and skills with regard to the TI implementation and capacity building. Both faculty shared that they were satisfied with the support and opportunities provided by the STRC.

### **Review of CV**

As is mentioned above resource persons lists were drawn through various sources. Discussions with organizations working on HIV and Health, suggestions from SACS and other STRCs related exploration on the internet etc have been the methods used. They have compiled the resources under the broad heads given in the table above.

A few randomly selected CVs were reviewed from among the National Level, State Level and Local resources. A healthy mix of programmatic experience, accounting experience emerged in the lot. Most CVs reviewed under the National and State level categories had moderate degree of experience with Health, HIV in general and TIs in specific. A review of a sample of CVs selected from the categorization of Local Resources indicates that the members have considerable experiences with regard to governance and rights of tribal communities and also have been engaged in capacity building exercised on the same.

### **3.2.2 Trainings by STRC**

#### **3.2.2.1 Identification of agencies/individuals to train peer educators**

As discussed above both the STRC and the TIs are relatively new to the experience of TIs. The team shared that organizations with previous histories with TIs were currently under investigation and therefore their resources could not be utilized. Hence in order to identify a fresh group of persons to train the PEs and VPLs the STRC explored options of individuals they have previously worked with and also solicited suggestions from SACS. 35 individuals were trained in a TOT on induction training for PES. 19 of these supported by the STRC conducted the trainings at the district level.

### **3.2.2.2 Number of trainings conducted**

The original work plan of the STRC outlined a) objectives wise activities to be undertaken in the year and b) training work plan.

- a) The activities outlined under the various objectives have been achieved to a moderate degree of success. Training Needs Assessment exercises, development of context specific manuals and training material, compilation of resource material coordination with SACs etc are some of the activities.
- b) The training work plan was formulated in the form of various capsules. (Induction capsule, Basic Capsules and Refreshers. The work plan was submitted in whole initially and then in parts for approval to the SACS. Approval was given only for some of these trainings as well as the themes approved or recommended were not always as highlighted in the capsule wise plan. In some other cases priority areas were decided by SACS and NACO (for instance PPP training roll out, PMs Training etc) and the STRC had to conduct these on priority basis.

While viewing the completion of trainings by the team it would be important to consider the delay in the receipt of funds from NACO. The first installment came through only in January 2010, while the contract was signed in Nov 2008. Needless to say operating without even the first installment for the entire contract period has had an adverse impact of trainings conducted and coordination with SACS. It would be worth noting that the STRC has despite these circumstances conducted an appreciable number trainings and activities presented below.

The table<sup>3</sup> below gives an overview of the trainings conducted by the STRC and the status of Pre and post assessments as well as field visits in the trainings.

---

<sup>3</sup> The first two trainings were conducted in partnership with SACs and TSU. It served as an introduction for the STRC to TIs.

S.no	Training name/ topic	Cadres	No of Batches	Pre and post test and Feedback	Field visit	Actual training load vs. Load of the planned
1.	Induction and CNA	PD, PM , ORW Coun		N	N	-
2.	Account Keeping	PD accountant		N	N	-
3.	Induction	PMs and ORWs	2	Written test taken on SACs demand and Feedback forms also filled	N	74/87
4.	Documentation and MIS	PMs , ORWs and Accountants At the request of SACs these were held back to back.	1	Written test taken on SACs demand and Feedback forms also filled	N	87/23
5.	Programme Management	PM	1	Feedback	N	23/23
6.	TOT on STI Management and PPP	STRC, MOs, CGSACS, TSU	1	N		19/22
7.	STI management and PPP decentralized trainings (cost borne)	Doctors	—	N	N	145/181
8.	TOT for Induction Training Peer educators and VPL	Various individuals with experience as either trainers or health related concerns	1	Y	N	35/ NA
9.	Induction for PE and VPL	PEs and VPL	19	Incomplete. Districts posting it to STRC.	N	362/424
10.	Outreach Planning	PM ORW	3	Y analysis only of objective type questions	N	78/84
11.	Programme Management	PD	1	Feedback	N	20/20
12.	Account Keeping	PD, PM, Ac		N	N	54/66

	Refresher					
13.	Data Collection tools and CMIS	PM , Ac , ANM/ Coun		N	N	31/36

N = No

Y= Yes

### 3.2.2.3 Field Visits for the training participants

No field visits were conducted for the participants. The team shared that none of the TIs in existence had attained the level of experience to prove to be model sites currently. They were only about a year old to the intervention as well as the chronic problem of staff attritions was delaying the process of stabilization of the programme in the TIs.

### 3.2.2.4 Identification of Learning Sites

Field visits have been made by the team members to various sites and 4 sites are currently been considered for development as a learning sites. These sites are Pratigya; Durg (Migrant), Pathpradarshat, Ambikapur (IDU); Samta Mahila Manch, Raipur (MSM); JanKalyan Sansthan, Rajnandgaon (FSW). The STRC said that the visits have been exploratory and to develop these sites as learning Sites would take intensive efforts.

### 3.2.2.4 Training needs Assessment/Capacity assessment of NGO partners

The STRC has attempted to understand the training needs of the TI personnel. A format was circulated with the TIs for PDs, PMs, and ORWs. The format sought some basic common intervention from each cadre as well as sought role specific information on Knowledge attitude and skills. However there were a few constraints in compiling the information and analysis.

- Owing to the high attrition rates in TIs many individuals who were a part of the exercise are no longer with their NGOs.
- All members have not responded to the questionnaire. The STRC staff have also visited the partners and completed the questionnaires with their team.

The completed responses were compiled.

S.no	Cadre	Responses
1	Programme Managers – (FSW , IDU , Migrant)	12 PMs



2	Project Director ( FSW , Migrant)	8 PDs
3	Outreach Workers – (FSW, IDU. Migrant )	22 ORWs
The TIs which have only filled the form for some cadres have not been included in the above number and have also been excluded from the analysis.		

The compilation needs to be further analyzed to identify areas for capacity building. As attrition is high individual TNA might not always provide dependable results. The STRC could also develop a basic understanding of TI capacity needs by reviewing the TI evaluation reports.

### **3.2.2.5 Pre and Post training evaluations**

There has been a very limited use of pre and post evaluations during the STRC trainings (please refer table under 3.2.2.2). In 2 of the 11 topics/themes of trainings pre and post tests were completed. In some of the trainings the exercises were incomplete as the trainings were field based and the filled forms were still awaited. In three other trainings feedback forms were used to understand the response of participants to the various sessions and logistics. Still in some other instances at the request of the DD –TI *written tests* were conducted for the participants.

An examination of the questionnaires used in these varied instances reveals the need for a more focused effort at making the same contextual and training specific. The STRC needs develop a more consistent system of conducting the pre and post assessment exercises as well as the content of the same.

### **3.2.2.6 Documentation of training including best practices.**

Training reports have been prepared for all trainings conducted. However there has been no emphasis on best practice documentation.

### **3.2.2.7 Translation of Training Modules.**

Developing training aids and materials in Hindi has been strength of Samarthan and they have been able to build a rich resource base. In the process of building their own understanding of TI implementation they have also translated simplified relevant sections of the operational guidelines to Hindi for the reference of the TIs. The discussion with training participants as well as interaction with Raipur MSM TI revealed that some of the material was distributed during

trainings and were found very useful by the participants. Some details of the STRCs efforts on this aspect have been captured below

Formats translated by the STRC for TIs

S.no	Name of tool or format	Maintained by
1	Abscess management	Clinic
2	Daily Summary	Clinic
3	Counseling register	Clinic
4	Medicine Stock register	Clinic
5	Patient register	Clinic
6	Referral register	Clinic
7	HRG registration form	ORW
8	FSW MSM IDU individual HRG tracking sheet	ORW
9	Monthly summary sheet	ORW
10	ORW weekly report	ORW
11	Guidelines for data collection tools	ORW
12	PE weekly Planning and activity sheet – IDU	PE
13	PE weekly tracking sheet IDU	PE
14	Guidelines PE weekly Planning and activity sheet -- MSM , FSW	PE
15	Advocacy format	PM
16	Commodity Register	PM
17	Community mobilization register	PM
18	Crisis management	PM

19	DIC register	PM
20	HRG master Register	PM
21	Movement register	PM
22	Training register	PM
23	NGO data collection and monitoring guide	PM

#### Modules and Material developed or translated by STRC initiative

1	Manual on conducting induction training for PEs and VPLs	This manual has been developed from the STRC experience with TOT and final training roll out for induction of PE and VPL
2	KHPT Manual on Outreach Planning	A translated version of the same was developed by IHAT, Jaipur. STRC reviewed it and developed a further simplified and contextualized version.
3	Basic Information , Hindi	Compiled from various sources and translated
4	Basic Information, Chhattisgarhi	Compiled from various sources and translated
5	STI Infection- What why and How,	Compiled from various sources and translated
6	Understanding operational guidelines – FSW	Simplified and translated from the operational guidelines
7	Understanding operational guidelines IDU	Simplified and translated from the operational guidelines
8	Community based needs assessment -	Based on the CAN training and field experience of the TIs
9	Yes Boss a	Comic in Hindi on IDU related issues
10	Card game	Information on Transmission, STI , Condom usage , Symptoms through images question answers etc.
11	Snakes and ladders	

#### IEC material translated for CGSACS

CGSACS requested the STRC in translation of some IEC material. A set of ten CDs were given to the STRC and the material the list of material they translated to Hindi is provided in the table below. A copy of the same was sent to NACO on 11<sup>th</sup> August 2009

S.no	Title – topics covered	Produced by
1.	Answer to your question- sex and sexuality	The Humsafar Trust
2.	How to use condoms	The Humsafar Trust
3.	STI manual	The Humsafar Trust
4.	Condom negotiation skills	APAC
5.	A story of Ratan, Mohan, Vijay	SPYM
6.	MSM Poster	SPACE
7.	Niganna Naidu , Migrants and risk behavior	KHPT
8.	FSW flipbook?	Alliance
9.	MSM Flip Book	Alliance
10.	MSM Flipbook	Mukta, Pathfinder
11.	FSW Flipbook	KHPT

Apart from the items listed above the STRC also has translated various presentations made by resource persons and relevant translated and developed material was given out to participants during trainings. The STRC has achieved a significant degree on this indicator. Though the various materials developed by the STRC has taken into account suggestions and modification provided by both training participants as well as community members , it would be imperative to build in a structured process of consultation , field testing and review of the various aids and manuals developed by STRC. With regard to translation too the STRC could invite a review by TIs or other STRCs, SACS or NACO. This would necessitate coordination and responsiveness on behalf of the other agencies involved.

### **3.2.2.8 Post Training field Visits**

The STRC team members have undertaken a number of field visits. Most of these visits were geared towards supporting the CNA process, TNA and Learning Site assessment. These visits have been recorded in the movement registers and a brief on the same is submitted while settling accounts. The team members could focus on developing a reporting system for field visits as they are an important component of their work and it would also reflect their specific observations on capacity building. Overall the number field visits undertaken and the on field support provided by the STRC shows an encouraging pattern of connecting classroom trainings and on field support.

S. No	Month and year	Place	Objective	Activities	STRC staff
1.	Mar 09	Raipur , MSM Sites	Participation in CNA	Identifying individuals and sites – MSM with TI, TSU and Mentors	Manish Jha and Ashutosh Tamrekar
2.	Mar 09	Korba	Participation in CNA	Discussions with TI staff on the progress of CAN and interactions at different sites	Manish Jha and Ashutosh Tamrekar
3.	Mar 09	Koriya	Participation in CNA with Mentors- IDU identification	CAN, Needle Syringe exchange demonstrations and mapping with Mentors	Ashutosh Tamrekar
4.	Mar 09	Raipur	MSM CNA Monitoring	Review and verification of records	Mercy Barla
5.	Mar 09	Koriya	CNA, FSW Identification	Visited sites with Mentor and conducted community meetings	
6.	Mar 09	Koriya	CNA monitoring IDU	Site visits	Manish Jha
7.	Mar 09	Bilaspur	CNA monitoring	Site visits with Mentors	Ashutosh Tamrekar
8.	May 09	Koriya	Learning Site assessment and TNA	Discussions with staff regarding project progress and processes. Discussions with individuals on the TNA format/tool	Manish Shrivastav
9.	May 09	Rajnandgaon	Learning Site assessment and TNA	“	Manish Shrivastava
10.	Jul	Jagdalpur	Learning Site	“	

	09		assessment and TNA		
11.	Jul 09	Rajnandagaon	Learning Site Assessment	Discussions with Staff and site visits	Manish Shrivastava
12.	Aug 09	Durg	Learning Site Assessment	Discussions with Staff	Ashutosh Tamrekar
13.	Sept 09	Raipur	Learning site Assessment	Site Visits	Manish Shrivastava
14.	Sept 09	Rajnandgaon	TNA	Meeting with Staff	Manish Shrivastava
15.	Oct 09	Ambikapur	IDU learning Site assessment	Site visit and discussions	Ashutosh Tamrekar
16.	Nov 09	Raipur	Support for Outreach planning at the request of TSU	Discussions with Staff	Ashutosh Tamrekar
17.	Nov 09	Durg	Learning Site assessment	Site visits and community meetings	Manish Shrivastava
18.	Nov 09	Rajnandgaon	Learning Site assessment	Site visits and community meetings	Manish Shrivastava

### **3.2.3 ACADEMIC COMMITTEE AND PROGRAMME PLANNING**

#### **3.2.3.1 Constitution of Academic Committee and its Meetings**

The academic committee has been constituted based on discussions with SACS and guidelines laid down for the same in the revised TOR. The Committee has met once (4<sup>th</sup> June 2009) in the course of the STRCs contract period. A review of the meeting minutes shows that the committee has discussed various aspects of the STRCs work, such as resource pool, module development, pre and post assessments, newsletter and website. Based on the review of the annual action plan developed by the STRC for itself, the committee made recommendations.

#### **3.2.3.2 Development of the work plan, monitoring indicators and the Budget**

The work plan of the STRC clearly indicates objective wise activities to be undertaken, monitoring indicators as well as timelines. The training calendar too takes into account the various capsules and levels of training. The work plan and training calendar were submitted to the SACs on the 5<sup>th</sup> of Feb 2009. These were also discussed with the Academic Committee in June 09.

### **3.2.3.3 Identify categories of personnel to be trained during the year**

Most categories of personnel have been included in the work plan but however the trainings have not been conducted in accordance to the plan. Priorities set by NACO and SACS have often changed the planned trainings and other hindrances such as funds and coordination concerns have proven to be a challenge. No clear rationale is available for the scheduling.

## **DOCUMENTATION AND REPORTING**

### **3.2.4.1 Documentation Centre**

Samarthan STRC has developed its own resources on some aspects of the TIS. The group has also collated information from various websites and sources and put it collated it for their use. Samarthan also has resources on various issues such as governance, rights of tribal communities based on its other programmes. The resource centre needs to be developed in a more organized fashion and it could definitely prove to be beneficial for the TIs. This however would also mandate a budgetary allocation.

### **3.2.4.2 Website**

The website has been prepared by the STRC and was reviewed by the evaluator. However the same has not been launched as the first installment was gravely delayed and in the current scenario the contract too has not been reviewed. If launched in the form as it exists at present it would prove to be a comprehensive and informative site.

### **3.2.4.3 Quarterly Newsletters**

The STRC had compiled a newsletter and complete with lay out design. The same has been sent for the DD- TIs review and discussions are on to include it into the SACS newsletter. Therefore the STRC has not yet been able to print and circulate it. The previous issue of the SACS newsletter has also covered an activity of the STRC.

### **3.2.4.4 Timely Submission of reports**

The team shared that the monthly reporting format was shared with them during June 09 and monthly reports have been submitted from July 09. No reports were submitted prior to this as no trainings were organized by the STRC. The trainings before June 09 were organized primarily by the CGSACS and TSU, while the STRC supported the same.



### **3.3 Organizational Capacity**

#### **3.3.1 Recruitment and induction**

##### **3.3.1.1. Office Setup**

The STRC is housed within the Samarthan office in Raipur and the space and personnel have been available for them since the contract was signed.

##### **3.3.1.2. Recruitment of Staff**

The current staff of the STRC has been associated with Samarthan's governance and training initiatives for a minimum of 5 years. Through an inter office memo 5 personnel were deputed for the activities of the STRC.

S.no	Name	Designation	Status
1	Dr Manish Shrivastava	Training Coordinator	Continuing from inception of STRC
2	Mr. Manish Jha	Training Officer	Discontinued after second TOR. Presently is associated as external consultant
3	Mr. Ashutosh Tamrekar	Training Officer	Continuing from inception of STRC
4	Ms Mercy Barla	Training Officer	Resigned on 10 <sup>th</sup> July – Notice period up to 10 <sup>th</sup> August 09
5	Ms Nur	Training Officer	Joined on 9 <sup>th</sup> March 2010

During Ms Mercy Barla's notice period, the STRC had shared the profile and CV of a candidate for NACOs approval. Since there was no response to this and the first installment too was yet to be disbursed, Samarthan did not move ahead with the recruitment.

##### **3.3.1.3. Induction of project staff**

As this was a fresh area of work for the organization the team had taken upon itself to understand their roles in accordance to the TOR as well as the operational guidelines. They have studied the same and interacted with the SACS and TSU to further contextualize their understanding.

#### **3.3.2 Staffing**

##### **3.3.2.1. Staff Turnover / Attrition**

One Training Officer position had to be cut down after the TOR was revised. Training Officer Ms Mercy Barla resigned on 10<sup>th</sup> July and continued with the organization till the 10<sup>th</sup> of August. The CV of a potential candidate was forwarded to NACO for approval. Considering the delay in funds disbursement and the lack of NACO's response on the new recruitment, the recruitment was stalled. However, after the release of the first installment and Ms Nur was recruited as Training Officer from the 9<sup>th</sup> of March.

#### **3.3.2.2. Staff's understanding of Role**

The staff has a clear understanding of its roles and responsibilities. The training coordinator and the Training Officer have understood their roles and are carrying them out in coordination with each other. The recruiting of another TO would help in increasing the pace of work.

### **3.3 Record keeping and Procedures**

#### **3.3.3.1. Maintenance of Staff Operational Records**

Various records in relation to travel attendance and field visits are systematically and diligently maintained by the STRC. The staff leave records are maintained in the Bhopal head office though approvals and requests are made in Bhopal. Leave records were made available for review. Samarthan also has in place an HR policy which is applicable to the staff of the STRC.

#### **3.3.3.2. Staff Meetings**

Staff meetings have been regularly held from Dec 08 to Dec 09. They were largely held during the first week of the month and clearly laid out agenda; highlights of decisions as well as plans for the upcoming month were documented. All minutes are signed by the team. They could document more details and focus on progress on the previous months plan.

#### **3.3.3.3 Governance and Leadership**

The STRC staff has been with Samarthan for long before the initiation of the STRC. They have been satisfied with their roles and the support and independence provided by Samarthan to the STRC. The team members were also part of discussions when Samarthan made the critical decision to bid for the STRC and therefore are part of the organizations decisions making processes and are aware of their roles.

Samarthan has supported the STRC for over a year both programmatically and financially as there were no funds disbursed by NACO. The STRC team in turn has made attempts to minimize the liability on Samarthan by managing with minimal staff and resources. The experience and leadership of Samarthan has proven to be a great asset to the STRC.

### 3.4 Financial Evaluation of the STRC

#### Chhattisgarh

##### 3.4.1 - Contract & its validity

National AIDS Control Organization as joint client with Chhattisgarh State AIDS Control Society entered into a contract bearing No. 16/2008-09 with 'Samarthan – Centre for development Support' Bhopal as consultant for establishment of a 'State Training and Resource Centre (STRC)' at Raipur for fulfilling the TI training needs for the state of Chhattisgarh for a period of one year effective from 15<sup>th</sup> November 2008. As an afterthought to ensure a more focused approach to capacity building of NGO implementing Targeted interventions in the state on the basis of discussion held on 20<sup>th</sup> January 2009 at NACO New Delhi, the scope of work and responsibilities of STRCs have been amended and revised version of the contract (Annexure A) was forwarded to Samarthan on 16<sup>th</sup> February 2009 for preparation of annual work plan aligned with the Annual Action plan of SACS which gets operational from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009. On the basis of the above D.O letter No. X-19014/41/2007-NACO TI of then Director Finance, the revised version of the contract was forwarded by the Executive Director of the consulting organization on 25<sup>th</sup> February 2009. Though the evaluation is supposed to be held at the end of twelve months, as per the revised terms (sub point iii under Para F) the annual evaluation for extension of STRC shall be conducted every April. Accordingly they are of the opinion that the revised contract period will be from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2009 to 31<sup>st</sup> March 2010. Modalities for payment of remuneration have been revised along with the revision of Annexure A, but total of the budget has never been changed. The details of the original and revised budget are as below:

Budget Head	Specification (15.11.2008- 14.11.2009 )	Original Budget	Specification (01.04.200931.03.2010 )	Revised budget
A. Remuneration:				

Training co-coordinator	30000/- pm	3,60,000/-	35000-50000	
Training officer	18000/-pm (3)	6,48,000/-	25000-35000 (2)	
External consult	750X3X80	1,80,000/-	-	
Community consultant	500X3X80	1,20,000/-	-	
Admin/ Accounts	8000/- pm	96,000/-	8000-10000	
<b>Total Remuneration</b>		<b>14,04,000/-</b>		<b>14,04,000/-</b>
<b>B. Reimbursable</b>				
Capacity assessment of TI	Lump sum	20,000/-	Lump sum	20,000/-
Training material	Lump sum	1,00,000/-	Lump sum	1,00,000/-
Website development.	3000/- pm	36,000/-	3000/- pm	36,000/-
Qtly Newsletter	5000/- pq	20,000/-	5000/- pq	20,000/-
Research	Per annum	80,000/-	Per annum	80,000/-
Travel	10000/- pm	1,20,000/-	10000/- pm	1,20,000/-
Management	4000/- pm	48,000/-	4000/- pm	48,000/-
Hall charges	800/-X 60	48,000/-	800/-X 60	48,000/-
Computer	1 set	40,000/-	1 set	40,000/-
LCD projector	One unit	60,000/-	One unit	60,000/-
<b>Total reimbursable</b>		<b>5,72,000/-</b>		<b>5,72,000/-</b>
<b>Total</b>		<b>19,76,000/-</b>		<b>19,76,000/-</b>

Service charge		2,44,234		2,44,234
<b>Contract ceiling</b>		<b>22,20,234/-</b>		<b>22,20,234/-</b>

### 3.4.2 - Operation of Bank Account and availability of Fund

Samarthan the consultant organization is located at Bhopal having a branch at Raipur. They were having a Savings Bank Account No. 63012328452 with State bank of India, C-6, Sector -1, Geetanjali Nagar, Raipur. Now the same account is being used for the STRC also. A certain amount was transferred from head office to this account as loan and the said amount was spent for the STRC activities. The Training co-coordinator Mr. Manish Shrivastava and one Training Officer Mr. Ashutosh Tamrakar are the nominated Joint signatories of the account. However, the only installment amounting Rs.11,49,601/- which was released by NACO after deduction of tax against their sanction of Rs. 12,81,607/- vide order dated 31<sup>st</sup> December 2009 was deposited in the account of the head office at Bhopal. One more sanction order was issued from NACO for Rs. 6, 91,600/- On 5<sup>th</sup> May 2009 releasing 35% of the approved budget, which is never receipt by Samarthan. **There is need for verification of the same.**

### 3.4.3 Utilization of Fund

As per the original contract, the validity was till 14<sup>th</sup> of November, 2009. Accordingly they submitted a claim till 30<sup>th</sup> November 2009 for a total amount of Rs. 12, 81,600/- which was reimbursed by NACO after deducting Tax at source. On the basis of the revised terms and on the basis of the confirmation through mail dated 26<sup>th</sup> January 2010, for continuation of activities, the STRC is continuing its activity as per schedule and expenditure for the period from December 2009 till date comes to Rs. 1,68,462/- and there is likelihood of spending Rs. 60,050/- till 31<sup>st</sup> March 2010. Details may be shown as below:

Budget Head	Allocation	Exp. Till Nov 2009	Exp. Dec'09 to March	Total exp.	Budget variance
-------------	------------	--------------------	----------------------	------------	-----------------

			<b>10</b>		
<b>A. Remuneration:</b>					
Staff Salary	1104000/-	895261/-	208710/-	1103971/-	29/-
External consult	1,80,000/-	111000/-	-	111000/-	69000/-
Community consultant	1,20,000/-	Nil	-	Nil	120000/-
<b>Total Remuneration</b>	<b>14,04,000/-</b>	<b>1006261/-</b>	<b>208710/-</b>	<b>1214971/-</b>	<b>189029/-</b>
	-	-	-	-	-
<b>B. Reimbursable</b>					
Capacity assessment of TI	20,000/-	20664/-	-	20664/-	(-) 664/-
Training material	1,00,000/-	85499/-	-	85499/-	14501/-
Website development.	36,000/-	12000/-	-	12000/-	24000/-
Qtly Newsletter	20,000/-	-	-	-	20000/-
Research	80,000/-	1400/-	-	1400/-	78600/-
Travel	1,20,000/-	81,838/-	10031/-	91869/-	28131/-
Management	48,000/-	29605/-	9771/-	39376/-	8624/-
Hall charges	48,000/-	-	-	-	48000/-
Computer	40,000/-	43800/-	-	43800/-	(-) 3800/-
LCD projector	60,000/-	-	-	-	60000/-
<b>Total reimbursable</b>	<b>5,72,000/-</b>	<b>274806/-</b>	<b>19802/-</b>	<b>294608/-</b>	<b>277392/-</b>
	-	-	-	-	-
<b>Total</b>	<b>19,76,000/-</b>	<b>1281067/-</b>	<b>228512/-</b>	<b>1509579/-</b>	<b>466421/-</b>
	-	-	-	-	-
Service charge	2,44,234	131950/-	23537/-	155487/-	88747/-
<b>Sanction ceiling</b>	<b>22,20,234/-</b>	<b>1413017/-</b>	<b>252049/-</b>	<b>1665066/-</b>	<b>555168/-</b>
	-	-	-	-	-

The above table shows that, after working for more than sixteen months (15<sup>th</sup> Nov. 2008 till 31<sup>st</sup> March 2010) the total utility in terms of approved Budget is only 76.4%. This is because, they have not procured the projector, Hall charges are not paid by them (booked under programs), Research study has not been conducted, separate News letter is not developed (information incorporated in SACS News letter). Web site has been developed, but registration and Web space booking is yet to be done. Community consultant has never been hired.

When asked about the reasons of not doing the above activities, it was stated that only training and related activities were prioritized from the available source of fund from the parent organization. Non-realizing of grant as per the agreed terms was the main reason for the same. No fruitful action has been taken for getting the first installment of 35% fund sanctioned during the month of May 2009 which was never received.

#### Programs Conducted:

<b>Name of Program</b>	<b>No of batches</b>	<b>Type of participant</b>	<b>Target/ Attendance</b>	<b>Budget</b>	<b>Actual Exp.</b>
Induction& documentation	2	PM & ORW	87/74	457480/-	
MIS, CMIS etc.	1	Accountant	23/13	96792/-	435529/-
Program Management	1	PM	23/23	151455/-	117863/-
PPP on STD	1	Govt Doctors	22/19	116280/-	54887/-
PPP on STD	7	Pvt. Doctors	181/145	303087/-	187622/-
TOT	1	Development professionals	35/35	216475/-	195299/-
Induction	15	PE/VPL	424/362	1398884/-	503649/-
Outreach Planning	3	PM, ORW	84/78	545940/-	470282/-



Program Management	1	PM	22/20	149700/-	69761/-
Financial record keeping	2	PD, PM, Accountant	66/54	139375/-	39121/-
DCT and CMIS	1	PM, ANM, Acctt.	36/31		Spent by SACS
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>35</b>		<b>1003/854</b>	<b>3346728/-</b>	<b>2074013/-</b>

The above table shows that, 35 programs were conducted to cater the program need of 854 participants. On an average around 25 participants attended in each program against average estimation of 29 participants (86% turnover). The budget utilization is around 62%. This is because of the fact that, audiovisual equipments of SACS were used. The SACS also provided support for developing the course materials beyond the course budget. TA was paid in actual which is less than the provision. Some of the programs were conducted at district level and at the NGO offices where actual expenditure was much lower. Hence, the overall utilization was less without compromising the quality of the programs.

#### 3.4.4 Maintenance of Financial records

Computerized system of financial record maintenance through Tally package is in practice. Vouchers are properly maintained with printed and serially numbered. Expenditure is made only after obtaining formal approval of competent authority. Though Executive Director of the parent organization is the ultimate authority of granting approval, formal delegation of power has been issued for expenditure relating to STRC expenditure. Power for approval of program related full as well as other expenditure to a certain limit is delegated to the Training Co-coordinator. All payments are released with proper approval. Bank Reconciliation Statement is prepared monthly. Cash Book and Ledger are all computerized. Rather than monthly, program wise SOE is prepared and forwarded to SACS for reimbursement.

Procurement of Assets and maintenance of Asset Register:

In spite of having provision for purchasing of one set of computer and one LCD Projector, only computer has been purchased. Due to lack of fund the Projector was not purchased. The procurement of computer is done through shopping procedure by collecting quotations. C.S has been prepared and purchase committee has evaluated the same and recommended the L-1. After obtaining approval of the competent authority only, the procurement has been made. There is computerized record of asset.

#### **3.4.5 Submission of SOE**

Course wise SOE is prepared to submit the same to SACS for reimbursement. SACS never release fund in advance, but reimburse only after receipt of the SOE. Quarterly SOE is prepared for the Salary and reimbursable account.

#### **Other observations:**

It has been observed that, delay in release of grant and not getting advance from SACS caused inconvenience in regular performance. In case reimbursement of actual expenditure also, tax has been deducted from the actual expenditure creating a gap in reimbursement. STRC is in a fix where from the gap will be fulfilled. As per the contract, against actual budget of Rs.19, 76,000/-, sanction ceiling was Rs. 22, 02,234/-. The service tax was charged above the budgeted amount. In case of issue of sanction order for release of reimbursement also the service tax should have been calculated extra on actual expenditure and deduct the same amount as tax. There is needed to look into the matter.

## **Annexure 1**

### **Group Discussions with trained NGO staff**

**Profile of the participants:** 5 PMs, 1 Ex PM, 4 ORWs, 1 Accounts cum MIS Officer was present for the discussion. Most participants (apart from an ORW who joined only in Feb2010) had attended a minimum of one training conducted by the STRC.

**Time Allocation for topics:** the participants were very satisfied with the time allotted to each topic in the training. They shared that often the resource persons and STRC team members were available till late in the night to discuss queries and hold discussions on the themes.

**Quality of resource persons** who were from other states was discussed. The participants shared that they found the resource persons knowledgeable and well informed. They were also largely satisfied with the methodologies used, however one individual shared that a little less of theory in the trainings would be helpful.

Knowledge and Skill of STRC Staff as trainers was found to satisfactory by the participants. They also shared that the STRC team members were able to simplify the various themes and discuss it with the participants.

**Resource Material provided:** the participants were more than satisfied in the reading/reference/resource material provided during the trainings. They shared that it helped them with reference once they were at work. One participant shared that the STRC could attempt to make the material a little brief.

**Training Venue and Logistics:** The participants found the accommodation, venue and other logistics excellent till Dec 09. However they shared that there had been a revision in the budget and the arrangements were poor in the trainings held in Jan and Feb 2010.

Overall the participants identified the positive attitude and involvement of the STRC team members as well as the methodologies and Hindi resource material developed by them as strengths of the training. They have suggested that there should be sufficient notice before training is announced.

## **Annexure 2**

### **Interaction with DD TI SACS – Roshni Subhash**

The evaluator had an interaction with the CGSACS DD- TI, Mr. Vikrant. DD- TI has been the point person for the STRC team in CGSACS and has played a supportive role in the progress of the STRC. Some of highlights of the discussions are placed below

- He shared that the lack of a local resource pool was a matter of concern for the CGSACS TIs. There was a high dependency on the neighboring states such as M.P and Gujarat for support. A challenge for both the SACs and The STRC would be developing local capacities and there has been movement in this direction through training of local resources in TOTs at the State and National Levels.
- The high attrition within the TIs is proving to be a challenge. The STRC would need to repeatedly train the same cadres on the similar modules as members in the TIs would have changed. Mixing of the old and new members was also causing some stress in training proceedings. The option of the monthly updated staff lists with the STRC was discussed. This would help them understand the current status of old and new staff members and plan relevant batches.
- Monthly Coordination meetings have been initiated with the various stakeholders in the TI. This would in future ensure smoother coordination and communication.
- The STRC was currently operating on a system of reimbursements with the SACS. They have shared that processes could take place as per plan if quarterly or monthly advances could be extended to them. The STRC still has some reimbursements pending from Sept 09. The DD- TI shared that there were constraints in advancing money to the STRCs and would require a directive from NACO. He also did share that there were procedural delays in reimbursement and now as the contract was yet to be renewed this was further compounded.

- Overall the D-Ti shared that after a slow start up, the STRC had now picked up pace and was able to fulfill its role better. He had no major concerns with regard to their performance.

### **Interaction with DD- TI SACS- Mr. Pankaj Sarma and Mr. Manish Mathur**

The Deputy Director (TI) of CGSACS was contact and enquired about the performance of the STRC and quality of Training. He believes that, gradually the quality of program has been improved. Invitation of experienced resource persons from outside the state, utilizing the experienced TSU officials are the main reasons. TOT for professionals has developed a competent resource pool in the state. That has gradually improved the quality of programs. Regular feedback is obtained through the POs.

It was suggested to develop a coordinated effort of SACS, STRC and TSU for disseminating information, preparation of need based training plan, monitoring of the training output, analysis of training gap, speaker's evaluation etc. to make a regular process for further development of the quality of training.

### **Annexure 3**

#### **Discussions with Faculty<sup>4</sup>**

##### **Kamlesh Bhatt, Baroda**

Mr. Kamlesh Bhatt has over 10 years of experience on the various themes within the ambit of HIV AIDS. He has been actively involved as a resource person and trainer in various workshops/trainings and evaluations conducted by the SACS. He shared that, working with the STRC on trainings in Chhattisgarh has been a pleasant experience. He has been given an advance notice of about 15 days prior to each training and has also been provided with resource material and relevant updates. He shared that his suggestion for the STRC would be to build their resources in relation to IDUs.

Overall the discussions with Mr. Kamlesh Bhatt, revealed a long association with TIs as well as a comfort with the topics (outreach planning) he has been a resource for.

##### **Yogendra Pratap, PD, Jan Kalyan Samajik Sansthan**

Mr. Yogendra Pratap shared his experience on issues like health , livelihoods and micro planning. The NGO headed by him has been implementing a TI since January 2009. Mr. Pratap has been a conducting trainings in the past on the said issues and the past year was his initial experience with TI related trainings. He shared that he was part of a group which had been trained on induction of PEs and VPLs by the STRC. He had further conducted inductions in various districts with the support of the STRC. He also shared that he had benefitted immensely from the TOT and was also supported by the STRC through materials as their presence during sessions conducted by him.

Mr. Pratap is part of the local resource pool that the STRC was planning to develop for decentralized training inputs. He was relatively new to TIs and was well supported by the STRC.

---

<sup>4</sup> Discussions with both the faculty was telephonic.

### **Discussions with Samarthan's Executive Director Mr. Yogesh Kumar <sup>5</sup>**

Mr. Yogesh shared the organizational perspective on taking up the role of the STRC. He shared that Samarthan had over 15 years of experience as a support organization on governance related concerns. Its forte has been the capacity building of local organizations and STRC was seen as a continuation of this thrust. He feels that given the some major challenges in its path, the STRC has still been able to achieve significant milestones. He does feel that in the upcoming year with regular support and fund disbursement from NACO, Samarthan would be able to perform to full capacity.

---

<sup>5</sup> Discussions with Mr. Yogesh Kumar were telephonic

## **Annexure 4**

### **Interactions with the MSM intervention of Samta Mahila Manch Raipur**

The evaluator visited Samta Mahila Manch DIC and Interacted with the MSM TI team there. PM, Accountant, 2 ORWs and over 6 Peer Educators. The discussions with the group were on the progress of the intervention, the on field support extended by the STRC, expectations from the STRC as well as suggestions on capacity building themes and areas.

The group spoke about the benefits they drew from the CNA training and the on field support they got from the mentors and STRC team. They shared that as the NGO and the members were relatively new to TIs the various methods discussed in the CNA training acted as a stimulant for work ahead. Using the various techniques as well as the guidance from the Mentors they were able to identify and establish contacts with large groups of MSMs. The feeling of isolation was overcome soon and the process was confidence instilling.

They shared that the support offered by the STRC team in the trainings as well as their visits was satisfactory and that the STRC was able to understand the MSM context. The areas for further training and capacity building as stated by the team members were

- Communication skills- In order to discuss HIV with the groups as well as to be able to lead them to ICTCs.
- Strategies for involving *high class MSMs* who were currently maintaining a distance from the project processes especially testing and medical services.
- A CBO has been formed by the group and they feel that they would require training on managing their organization and finances in the future.

The group overall was comfortable with the STRC and spoke of the quality trainings and inputs. They suggested that the documents and manuals developed by the STRC could use a simpler language and the team members could learn the terms used by the community and use it in



trainings. This would ensure that the participants became more comfortable and understood the training content better.